### Daftar Isi (Table of Content)

#### Journal of Government & Civil Society

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page Range</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 146 – 163  | New Public Management (New Public Comparison Meta-Analysis Developed and Developing Country Policies) | Dyah Mutiarin¹, Misran¹  
(¹Department of Government Affairs and Administration, Jusuf Kalla School of Government, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia) |
| 164 – 183  | Policy Networks: Actors, Interests, and Power Relations in the Jakarta Reclamation Project | Rizki Hegia Sampurna¹-², Chih-Chieh Chou¹  
(¹Department of Political Science, National Cheng Kung University (NCKU), Taiwan)  
(²Universitas Muhammadiyah Sukabumi (UMMI), Indonesia) |
| 184 - 197  | National Insights and Youth Political Attitudes in Rural Lampung Against Negative Campaign | Hertanto¹, Handi Mulyaningsih², Asep Nurjaman³  
(¹Departement of Government Science, Universitas Lampung, Indonesia)  
(²Departement of Sociology, Universitas Lampung, Indonesia)  
(³Departement of Government Science, Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang, Indonesia) |
| 198 - 213  | Ethnic Identity and Local Politics: Study on Regional Head Election in Merauke Regency 2020 | Misran Alfarabi¹, Wahdania Sardi¹, Zuly Qodir¹  
(¹Department of Government Affairs and Administration, Jusuf Kalla School of Government, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia) |
| 214 – 236  | Stakeholder Collaboration Model for Ecotourism Development (Studi in Batu City, Indonesia) | I Gede Eko Putra Sri Sentanu¹, Ardian Prabowo¹, Klara Kumalasari¹, Aulia Puspaning Galih¹, Rendra Eko Wismanu¹  
(¹Department of Public Administration, Universitas Brawijaya, Indonesia) |
| 237 – 262  | Farmers Social Movement Studies: A Systematic Literature Review for A Conceptual Model | Wahyudi¹  
(¹Department of Sociology, Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang, Indonesia) |
Factors Affecting Trust in E-Government

Ulung Pribadi¹, Muhammad Iqbal², Fittia Restiane³

¹ Post-Graduate Program Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia
² Department of Political Science National Cheng Kung University, Taiwan
³ Department of Government Affairs and Administration Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia
Stakeholder Collaboration Model for Ecotourism Development  
(Studi in Batu City, Indonesia)

I Gede Eko Putra Sri Sentanu, Ardian Prabowo, Klara Kumalasari, Aulia Puspaning Galih, Rendra Eko Wismanu

1 Departemen of Public Administration, Universitas Brawijaya, Indonesia

* Email Correspondence: sentanu@ub.ac.id

ABSTRACT
This research aims at creating a concept of cooperation between stakeholders in developing eco-tourism in Batu City. Eco-tourism and the role of stakeholders are related to one another. It is due to the urge of stakeholders to work together in managing the potential of eco-tourism to achieve a development goal. This study applies the Penta-helix model and triple-bottom-line theories to investigate the contribution of stakeholders to sustainable development. The Penta-helix model is used to identify relevant stakeholders and conduct effective collaboration. At the same time, the triple-bottom-line is applied to observe the environmental and socio-economic aspects of the eco-tourism sector. This study employs a qualitative method with an interactive approach from Miles, Huberman, and Saldana by deepening literary understanding; and field interviews. The results of this study show that cooperation and interaction between stakeholders in developing eco-tourism are inferior. Thus, the researchers develop a stakeholder collaboration model through the Penta-helix model covering the government, private eco-tourism enterprises, communities, academics, and the media. They collaborate in determining the sustainability agendas covering environmental, economic, and social as a reflection of the triple bottom line element. Those designed agendas are to encourage the realization of eco-tourism development in Batu City, Indonesia. The research recommends further research to evaluate whether this eco-tourism development model can be effective if implemented.

Keywords: Stakeholder collaboration, eco-tourism, triple bottom line, penta-helix model

ABSTRAK

merekomendasi pada penelitian selanjutnya untuk mengevaluasi apakah model pembangunan ekowisata ini dapat efektif jika diimplemetasikan.

Kata Kunci: Kolaborasi pemangku kepentingan, ekowisata, triple bottom line, penta helix model

INTRODUCTION

An over-growth-oriented development approach has resulted in social exclusion and three majority crises in violence, poverty, and environmental destruction (Korten, 2006). According to Arowoshegbe & Emmanuel (2016), ignoring the current and predicted imbalances in natural systems (such as shortages of freshwater, energy supply, global climate change, and population increases) will harm economic systems and the quality of human life. This condition requires a new development paradigm, especially development that is based on economic growth and takes sides with social and environmental aspects. This development approach is called sustainable development. Sustainable development has a high potential for every community within economic, social, cultural, ecological, and physical boundaries (Bhuiyan et al., 2012).

Moreover, the importance of sustainable development in every sector of activity (Alinska et al., 2018; United Nations, 2008) includes the tourism sector (Kiper, 2013). Hall (2008) states: “sustainable development and tourism present-change which refers to the movement from one state or condition to another.” It implies that tourism is a very complex activity and therefore it requires tools as assistance in effective decision making to accept the competing economic, social, and environmental demands of sustainable development (Fadahunsi, 2011). This activity is called eco-tourism, which focuses on the economic and social sectors and on preserving environmental balance (Syarif, 2017; Taufiq, 2014). So that eco-tourism is rooted in the concept of sustainable development (Stem et al., 2003). Kiper (2013) argues that eco-tourism is a sustainable version of tourism in natural areas, which at the same time, includes elements of rural and cultural tourism. In addition to this, Yoeti (2016: 195) states that eco-tourism refers to eco-friendly tourism. It suggests that tourism activities should be related to nature and invite the tourists to see and witness the beauty of nature in up close, enabling them to enjoy the authenticity of nature and its environment so that it can inspire them to love nature. The advantages of implementing eco-tourism are in the form of a contribution to government revenue and a provision of job vacancies (Faladeobalade & Dubey, 2014). Moreover, eco-tourism is one of the fastest-growing segments of the sustainable tourism industry (Das & Syiemlieh, 2009; UNEP, 2013). In addition, the tourism industry is also the largest foreign exchange contributor for developing countries like Indonesia (Holik, 2016).

In addition to this, government participation is necessary for the developing economy. It can control tourism planning and promotion directly (Bhuiyan et al., 2011). The importance of the government’s role in realizing eco-tourism means that stakeholders have a role in eco-tourism (Hidayah et al., 2019). The involvement of stakeholders in the
eco-tourism development process is desirable and necessary to create real eco-tourism (Su et al., 2014; Osman et al., 2018). The involvement of non-governmental tourism actors in developing tourist destinations is necessary (Zaenuri et al., 2021). Since various stakeholders are potentially interested in eco-tourism development, analyzing all the main stakeholders should be a significant step in building a network. It was also weighty to categorize and define their roles during the planning process to identify gaps to achieve a balance between underrepresented or more stakeholders (Taschner & Fiedler, 2009). Referring to Kuhaja (2014) as tourism development refers to a very complex effort, the efforts of developing tourism are not merely the government’s responsibility, but the active participation from the public and the private sector are also expected in terms of planning, implementing, and controlling tourism.

Besides, Wondirad et al. (2020) argue that stakeholder collaboration as the main factor in sustainable eco-tourism development in developing countries uses stakeholder theory to map stakeholders. Besides, it employs collaboration theory to observe the cooperation forms between related parties and how they are on the triple-bottom-line principle. Furthermore, the approach of the stakeholder collaboration model is different from one region to another (European Commission, 2017). Meanwhile, Hardianto (2019) examines the Penta-Helix Synergy on Tourism Development in Batu, East Java, or tourism development in Batu City through the Penta-helix synergy model approach. This Penta-helix’s actors (stakeholders) refer to government, business, media, academia, and the environment. Research conducted by Hardianto did not show the community (as the actors) to be the most important actors. Local communities want to have a voice in development issues to protect community interests, increase transparency and accountability, and wipe out embezzlements and abuse of offices, which are rampant acts amongst decision-makers (Muganda et al., 2013).

On the contrary, in his research conducted by Widowati et al. (2019), the development of eco-tourism requires the involvement of five parties to accelerate the establishment maximally as the synergy of stakeholders can direct the community to achieve the goal of developing agro-tourism potential. From the previous research, it leads to community empowerment in realizing agro-tourism. From these previous studies, researchers tried to improve stakeholder collaboration models in eco-tourism development by combining the Penta-helix model and triple bottom line concepts that did not exist before or separately in developing eco-tourism.

Batu City is one of the cities with a development concept based on natural tourism because Batu City has geostrategic regional tourism potential. In addition, Batu City is a gateway to enter Kawasan Strategis Pariwisata Nasional (KSPN) or the national tourism strategic area, namely the Bromo-Tengger-Semeru area. However, in the tourism development process in Batu City, there are still obstacles such as still not being controlled properly or not having a blueprint in the development planning of each of the influential
actors in the development of eco-tourism in Batu City. According to Obot & Setyawan (2017), in a study entitled Implementation of Batu City Government Policies in Realizing an Environmentally Sustainable Tourism City, that the development of Batu City tourism still has obstacles, one of which is the conversion of land functions carried out by the community, and the private sector. Where people use forestland for agriculture. While the private sector builds residential areas, hotels, and artificial tourism, it needs a model for actors in the development of eco-tourism tourism. This study aims to provide a conceptual framework for the five actors involved in developing eco-tourism in Batu City, Indonesia.

RESEARCH METHOD

In an advanced data collection process, researchers search for meaning or an explanation of causes. Researchers make conclusions based on the obtained data with strong evidence at the data collection stage. If there is no supporting evidence, the initial conclusion is assumed as temporary. Therefore, they may change. But if valid (strong) substantiation supports the initial conclusion, then it is categorized as an accurate conclusion. Not only employing interactive methods in managing data, but researchers also applying Osman’s (2018) data collection techniques and methods. These data collection techniques and methods have several stages, as follows:

![Figure 1 The Stages of the Research Methodology](Source: Adopted by Osman et al. (2018))

There are two parts shown in that picture. Those parts comprehend the story behind each eco-tourism development initiative, gather necessary pieces of documentary evidence, and critically mapping stakeholder networks covering who was involved or participated in such development. The first part critically reviews the requirements for eco-tourism development and the potential for collaboration planning (CP) to address these
requirements. Furthermore, in the second part, there are several documentary evidence collection and interview stages. The first interview stage involves two interviewees from the Batu City government, who are in charge of eco-tourism development in Batu City. Besides, the second interview focused on evaluating the eco-tourism planning process, which has been experienced in each place in Batu City with three interviewees. It includes representatives from relevant actors. Several stakeholders have been involved directly in the process. Thus, the researcher can provide the best opportunity and ability to explain and discuss their experiences about eco-tourism planning in depth.

Furthermore, this study employs purposive sampling and data collection techniques with specific considerations (Sugiyono, 2015) in determining the interviewees. They are expected to be able to provide complete information to the researcher. All interviewees gave consent to the interview after the nature and objectives of the study were explained clearly. The selected qualifications of interviewees are the Tourism Awareness Group as part of the community that participates in encouraging tourism development in Kungkuk Tourism Village, Batu City. The governments of Batu City, including the Bumiaji District Government, the Tourism Office, and Perhutani (as regulators and facilitators for the community’s needs related to tourism), allow the construction of a tourist attraction in forest land along with tourism management (business). It includes the management of outbound, cafes, and other tourism objects in the Tourism Village of Kungkuk as an actor who also plays a role in developing the Tourism Village of Kungkuk. That study was implemented from March to August 2020.

Research framework in this research, Osman et al. (2018) obtained the conceptual framework used to evaluate the eco-tourism initiative. There are two main components: (1) How can stakeholder networks be established and sustained during the planning process?; and (2) How effective are the stakeholders during those different stages of the planning process, and how can participation rates be increased? Thus, stakeholders need to collaborate on the eco-tourism development planning process. It started from the network development from stakeholders and involved the stakeholder in the planning. According to the researcher’s finding in picture 4, the recommendation is for a stakeholder collaboration framework in developing eco-tourism. This framework is a complement to previous research conducted by Hardianto (2019), Wondirad et al. (2020) and Widowati (2019). According to Wondirad et al. (2020), stakeholder collaboration is the main factor in sustainable eco-tourism development, especially in developing countries using this theory to map the stakeholder. The collaboration theory considers how cooperation forms between actors at the triple-bottom-line principle.

Cooperation between stakeholders in the scope of development is necessary (Wanna, 2006). Lacomba et al. (2011) argue that based on its probability in the future, the collaboration is more likely than the competition. It is due to the financial constraints that tend to increase rather than reduce competitive pressure. The concept of this relationship
is successful in identifying paradoxes or tensions (problems) found in organizations (Chin et al., 2008). In line with this, the research results conducted by Zeho et al. (2020) found that stakeholder collaboration has a positive role in the accountability of village funds. In addition to this, the research results from Laurisz (2019) show that stakeholders play a role in developing the economic sector and the tourism sector (Fathimath, 2015). From the results of these previous studies, stakeholder collaboration theory is necessary for various development sectors, especially in eco-tourism development. The importance of stakeholder collaboration is inseparable from the concept of the Penta-helix model.

Besides, Muhyi et al. (2017) state that the Penta-helix model in a simple way can be interpreted as a framework to optimize the results of activities or work through multi-stakeholder engagement. There are five parties to be reckoned with in terms of their roles, interests, and character. They are administration (government), society (people), business/investors, knowledge (researchers), and media. Penta-helix collaboration, a collaborative activity between Academic, Business, Community, Government, and Media lines/fields, otherwise known as ABCGM, is known to accelerate the development of considerable potential (Yunas, 2019; Muhyi et al., 2017). Meanwhile, the Triple Bottom Line concept is decision-making that considers social, environmental, and economic aspects (Dwyer, 2015). The Triple Bottom Line can test the efficiency of the tourism sector because it consists of actors who have different values and interests (Wondirad et al., 2020). In addition to this, Carter and Rogers (2008) and Sapukotanage et al. (2018) Triple-Bottom line approach is a popular framework used to evaluate the sustainability of a supply chain where it is not only concerned with financial aspects. It emphasizes environmental and social measures.

Therefore, the Triple-Bottomline considers the balance of environmental, social, and economic elements in carrying out development in all sectors of activity. Combining these two theories allows current research to understand better the precise mechanisms of stakeholder analysis and eco-tourism development strategies. This solution will be more sustainable in the long term because it will meet more stakeholder needs socially,
environmentally, and economically (Lee, 2007). The researcher expects that stakeholders will not only pursue profit but also pursue the Triple-Bottom line. Thus, the success of the Triple-Bottom line depends on the role of stakeholder action (Vergetis, 2000).

In this study, there was no specific theory of cooperation between actors. Moreover, the case studies in this study are in developing countries and not specifically in Indonesia, so they cannot be the main approach in eco-tourism development. Since an approach from the stakeholder collaboration model is different from one region to another (European Commission, 2017). Meanwhile, according to Hardianto (2019), the role of actors in this penthalix, such as government, business, media, academia, and the environment, is very important. However, this research did not show that community actors were the most important actors. At the same time, community participation is very helpful in eco-tourism development. For instance, voicing development, protecting community interests, increasing transparency and accountability, and corruption (Muganda et al., 2013). Meanwhile, in the study conducted by Widowati et al. (2019), the development of eco-tourism requires the involvement of five parties to accelerate its development optimally because the synergy of stakeholders can direct the community to achieve the goal of developing agro-tourism potential.

According to several previous studies, the researcher used the Pentahelix method, namely government, private, media, academia, the environment, and environmental, economic, and social element. Those elements show in the triple bottom line concept. This becomes a differentiator or renewal from the previous study that researchers have done by integrating the pentahelix model theory with triple bottom line principles. The framework unifies eco-tourism stakeholders in a platform to enable discussion and action on important issues and the eco-tourism sector (Wondirad et al., 2020). According to Muhyi et al. (2017), the Pentahelix model is done to make it simple and can be interpreted as a framework for optimizing the results of activities or work through multi-stakeholder engagement. Pentahelix Collaboration is a collaborative activity among Academics, Businesses, communities, Government, and Media to develop a large amount of potential (Yunas, 2019). Eco-tourism development requires the involvement of those 5 parties to accelerate its development mainly because the synergy of stakeholders can direct the community to achieve development goals (Widowati et al., 2019). Pentahelix is done to obtain the map of stakeholders and collaborative activities. The synergy is needed among the tourism destination development, tourism industry, and tourism institution (UNWTO, 2018). If you want to see the success of the collaborative planning process, you can identify the relevant stakeholders and their potentials and barriers. This is based on the level of involvement and the effect on decision-making that reflects their interests (Osman et al., 2018).
RESULTS AND DISSCUSSION

Results

Batu City has a strategic position for the development of regional potential geostrategically. The economy of Batu City is supported by several sectors, one of which is tourism. Batu City has a wealth of natural tourism with a beautiful and charming panorama, located in a mountainous area, has fresh air temperature. This condition is suitable for agriculture and plantations with the development of tourism with natural nuances. It makes Batu City becomes the center of agriculture and tourism (Lestari & Firdausi, 2017). Besides, Batu City has adequate facilities and infrastructure. Therefore, BAPPEDA or Development Planning Agency at Sub-National Level of Batu City said Batu City as the “The Real Tourism City of Indonesia.” Batu City has become well known as a mainstay tourist destination in Malang Regency and “the belle” of tourist attractions in East Java Province (Lestari & Firdausi, 2017). Batu City is one of the cities with a development concept based on natural tourism because Batu City has geostrategic regional tourism potential. In addition, Batu City is a gateway to enter Kawasan Strategis Pariwisata Nasional (KSPN) or the national tourism strategic area, namely the Bromo-Tengger-Semeru area. However, in the tourism development process in Batu City, there are still obstacles, such as still not having a blueprint in the development planning of each of the influential actors in the development of eco-tourism in Batu City. According to Obot & Setyawan (2017), Batu City tourism development still has obstacles, one of which is the conversion of land functions carried out using forestland for agriculture, builds residential areas, hotels, and artificial tourism.

Figure 3. Batu City Map and Ecotourism Destinations
Source: Karinov.co.id, 2020; outboundmalang.com, 2017; Winartie, 2015
(Remanged by the Researcher, 2020)
The stakeholders also contribute to the development of eco-tourism in Batu City. Thus, it triggers the researcher to identify each stakeholder involved in developing eco-tourism in Batu City. The involvement of a tourism awareness group (Pokdarwis) has a crucial role in building eco-tourism in Batu City, as stated by the chairman of Pokdarwis, Bumiaji, stating that:

“Kelompok sadar wisata sangat berperan dalam mengenalkan, melestarikan, dan memanfaatkan potensi daya tarik wisata lokal. Kepala Pokdarwis dan masyarakat sekitar juga turut serta mengelola potensi wisata desa wisata Kungkuk menjadi daya tarik wisata dan menjadi daya tarik bagi wisatawan untuk dikunjungi” (The tourism awareness group has a role in introducing, preserving, and utilizing the potential of local tourist attractions. The head of Pokdarwis and the surrounding community participate in managing the tourism potential of Kungkuk tourism village to become a tourist attraction and become an attraction for tourists to visit) (based on an interview conducted on July 14, 2020).

The statement above implies that Pokdarwis plays a crucial role in management. Besides, good management will encourage the development of tourism in the Kungkuk Tourism Village. The management carried out by the Kutut Tourism Awareness Group includes the management of tourism objects, outbound management, cafes, and the management of other tourism objects in Kungkuk tourism village. Apart from Pokmawas, the participation of young people in Bumiaji Village is very helpful in managing the tourist village of Kungkuk. The chairman of Pokdarwis Bumiaji states:

“Sejak desa wisata kungkuk sudah berjalan, anak muda disini semakin aktif mengelola desa wisata, beberapa diantaranya adalah pemandu wisata, hampir semua karyawan disini adalah anak muda lokal” (Since Kungkuk tourism village has been running, the young people here are increasingly active in managing tourist villages, some of which are tour guides, almost all employees here are local young people) (Interview conducted on July 14, 2020).

These young people help in accompanying tourists when visiting Kungkuk tours. Meanwhile, another actor seen in eco-tourism development is the Batu City Government through the Tourism Office. The Head of Human Resources for the Batu City Tourism Office stated:

“Dinas pariwisata memfasilitasi kebutuhan masyarakat terkait pariwisata dalam pengembangan objek wisata. Kami juga membantu mempromosikan pariwisata di kota Batu. Misalnya dengan mengadakan event tahunan, mengadakan study tour antar kota maupun desa wisata, dan mengadakan sosialisasi desa wisata di setiap kabupaten” (The
tourism office facilitates the needs of the community related to tourism in development of tourist objects. We also help to promote tourism in the city of Batu. For example, by holding annual events, holding study tours between cities as well as tourism villages, and holding socialization of tourist villages in each regencies/cities) (interview conducted on July 14, 2020)

Based on the Head of the human resources sector’s statement following the Regulation of Mayor of Batu Number 73 of 2016 concerning Position, Organizational Structure, Job Description and Work Procedure of the Batu City Tourism Office, the role given by the Tourism Office includes providing resource facilities Humans, developing tourism promotion, developing tourism products. Apart from the role of the Batu City Government, Perhutani also plays a crucial role. Perhutani, as a stakeholder, plays a role in decision-making and policymakers in the development of eco-tourism in Batu City, specifically in the Bumiaji District. Perum Perhutani is a State-Owned Enterprise (BUMN). PERUM Perhutani has a very crucial role in ensuring the existence of forest areas as a support for the environmental, social, and economic carrying capacity of the community based on Government Regulation Number 72 of 2010 Article 7 concerning public companies (PERUM) of State forestry has mandated that in Forest Management. Furthermore, to establish a tourist attraction, the owner must ask permission from Perhutani since Batu City has an area surrounded by forests.

Another concern is the role of business or the private sector. In Bumiaji District, there is the Kaliwatu Rafting tour managed by a private sector with sustainable eco-tourism. Kaliwatu Rafting Tourism in collaboration with Kungkuk Village tours. According to information from the manager of the village tour in the village of Kungkuk regarding cooperation stating that:

“Kerjasama Desa Wisata Kungkuk dengan Wisata Arung Jeram Kaliwatu merupakan bentuk kepercayaan kami dalam mengembangkan pariwisata berbasis ekowisata berkelanjutan. Kerjasama dimulai dengan paket wisata untuk wisatawan, pola pengembangan ekowisata berkelanjutan, dan promosi kedua hal tersebut. Ini adalah bentuk kerjasama kami atas kepercayaan kami dengan wisata Rafting Kaliwatu” (The cooperation of the Kungkuk Tourism Village with Kaliwatu Rafting Tourism is a form of our belief in developing sustainable eco-tourism-based tourism. The collaboration starts with tour packages for tourists, sustainable eco-tourism development patterns, and the promotion of these two tours. It is a form of our cooperation based on the trust on our part with the Kaliwatu Rafting tour) (an interview conducted on July 14, 2020)
The interview result shows that there is a contribution by the private sector in managing the Kaliwatu Rafting. It seems that the belief is established on the management of Kungkung tourist village with Kaliwatu Rafting, and the belief from Perum Perhutani to the local villager of Kungkung tour. The result also shows that some stakeholders play a role in Batu City, such as the Tourism Awareness Group, Batu City Government, and Perhutani and Tour Management (Business). However, the data shows that the role of stakeholders in collaboration has not been maximized, and the absence of other stakeholders involved, such as media and academics.

Along with the efforts to develop tourism in Batu City, the researcher hopes that Batu City will get better in development, especially tourism development. The good paradigm of development is the sustainable paradigm which uses four benchmarks: pro-economic welfare, pro-environmentally sustainable, pro-social justice, and pro-environment (Sutrisna, 2006). The involvement of many actors influences tourism development, especially eco-tourism, in Batu City; the researcher identified these actors are Batu City Government, Perhutani, Pokdarwis, and Tourism Management (Business). According to the researcher, the involvement of these actors can be added to the other actors and their roles maximized. The involvement of stakeholders in the process of eco-tourism development is not only desired but also required to ensure the genuine eco-tourism (Su et al., 2014) because some stakeholders interested to develop eco-tourism, analyzed toward all major stakeholders should be an important step in building a network (Taschner & Faidler, 2009).

From those statements, the researcher identified that there needs to be a classification between the highest level stakeholders and the below. To do the classifier, a discussion among all stakeholders involved in the eco-tourism development is needed. It is in alignment with CISS & EDG (2012), which stated that all stakeholders should be gathered to classify according to the appointed individual’s position (Top Executive, First line decision-makers, employees of regional/local executives), or the sector (public, private, local communities and NGOs). Each potential stakeholder is considered to have the same level of importance, although they have different interests, influences, and powers on matters. The main invented stakeholders from both initiatives were involved in most activities regardless of their background or position. In developing eco-tourism in Batu city, the researcher identified stakeholders who played an important role and maximized their role. The development of a conceptual framework combines an understanding of the requirements for successful eco-tourism development with the potential for a collaborative planning approach to address their requirements.
Discussion

In analyzing the pentahelix model, the researcher has two formulations to identify the stakeholder: who is involved in the ecotourism development? And what are their roles (stakeholders) in the collaboration? The further information is:

1. Government. Government has the main role in developing the tourism sector, such as regulators, facilitators, and encouraging success in tourism governance (Sentanu & Mahadiansar, 2020). This role as a facilitator can be seen especially in supplying infrastructure which is still under assured by the Tourism Office, facilities for distributing stimulant funds for people who want to develop tourism objects, efforts to promote tourism objects, as well as facilities provided to the third parties such as investors and tourism entrepreneurs to develop their tourism business in Batu City. Government participation is required in developing economies where tourism planning and promotion tend to be directly controlled by the government (Bhuiyan et al., 2011). So far, the Batu City Government has not focused on eco-tourism development. This is a new focus that needs to be developed by the Batu City Government. In addition, the government has not maximized the natural potential contained in Batu City in eco-tourism development; so far, the development has only ‘replaced’ not ‘managed’ natural tourism potential into artificial ones. The absence of an Ecotourism Road Map in Batu City has also resulted in many private parties and the public being able to freely convert the function of green land into residences, villas, agriculture, and others. In addition, the government has not tried to maximize the role of existing actors, not only the community and the private sector. However, it can also invite academics and the media.

2. Kungkuk Village Tourism is one form of eco-tourism that can be developed in Batu City. Meanwhile, State-Owned Enterprise (BUMN) is still under the government. BUMN referred to in the development of eco-tourism in Batu City, which plays a role as PT Perhutani through Government Regulation Number 72 of 2010 concerning State Forestry Public Company (Perum) or called Perhutani. Perhutani has the authority to manage social forests, so the people who want to manage within the area must go through Perhutani. This statement is based on government regulation Number 44 of 2004 about forestry planning, Law Number 18 of 2013 concerning prevention and eradication of forest destruction, and Regulation of Director General of Social Forestry. The government (Tourism Office) facilitates the community’s needs related to tourism in the development of tourist objects. We also help to promote tourism in the city of Batu. For example, by holding annual events, holding study tours between cities and villages, and holding socialization of tourist villages in each regency/city.

3. Private eco-tourism enterprises. Several private sectors act as facilitators between players in terms of eco-tourism. By increasing public understanding, protected area
entrepreneurs and managers (Perhutani) contribute to a better assessment of the economic and environmental feasibility of an eco-tourism venture. Besides, private eco-tourism enterprises can be created based on community or private principles. In addition to this, partnerships can take many forms depending on the circumstances. It can be assisting eco-tourism ventures with financing, land leases, marketing, promotion, or impact monitoring (Drumm et al., 2004). This form of cooperation is also found in the management of the Kungkuk Tourism Village. In the development of eco-tourism in Kungkuk Tourism Village. Private parties and the community play an important role in the development of this eco-tourism. The collaboration between the two stakeholders is the second initiative, meaning that the government does not participate in establishing the Kungkuk tourism village. The form of cooperation from the private sector is managing several Kaliwatu Rafting services, selling tour packages for tourists, sustainable eco-tourism development patterns, and tourism promotion. Private eco-tourism enterprises need to manage it properly to minimize environmental damage and contribute to the community and other stakeholders (Romero-Brito et al., 2016). It can be a ‘standard view’ of industrial responsibility reflecting: 1) social movements, 2) loose, flexible, and growing partnerships creating new market dynamics, 3) the hospitable tourism industry for local people, governments, and communities, 4) the obligation to protect and preserve nature, culture, and legacy of resources to sustain the economy and be passed on uninterruptedly to future generations (UNEP, 2001; WTO, 1995; Arevin et al., 2014). The form of cooperation between the private sector and the community that exists in Kungkuk Tourism Village is going well; so far, there has been no environmental damage done by the private sector. This is very good because, in other locations in Batu City, there is a lot of damage done by the private sector, such as making villas or making artificial tourism in nature.

4. Community. Community participation in the development of eco-tourism as “an eco-tourism program that is controlled and participated actively by the local communities who inhabit or have natural attractions.” plays a crucial role. Kiss (2004) argues that through the involvement of local communities, tourism can generate support for conservation among these communities as long as they derive some benefit. Hence, community-based eco-tourism is the best choice to earn income by running a tourism business in areas that are conserved, owned, and managed by the community (Das & Syiemlieh, 2009). Community-based ecotourism in protected areas has supported the livelihoods of local communities by providing opportunities for national and international visitors to engage in community activities (Acharya & Halpenny, 2013). Besides, management strategies must focus on achieving sustainability by involving local communities (Walsh & Zin, 2019). Community involvement was also carried out in the kungkuk tourism village. A tourism awareness group in which local communities play a very important role in managing the tourism potential of the
kungkuk tourism village to become a tourist attraction and become an attraction for tourists to visit. In addition, since the Kungkuk tourism village has been running, these young people are increasingly active in managing the tourist village, some of whom are tour guides, almost all of the employees here are local youth. These findings prove that there is a high level of awareness about eco-tourism projects in forest fringe communities. It implies that the essence of community participation is capacity building. For local communities to be better positioned to make meaningful contributions to eco-tourism development and management, they must possess definite crucial competencies. However, they also need to consider the capacity building of local communities living around social forests through management training, hospitality, tour guides, and other job skills. The essence of community participation in tourism is involvement in shaping life as a human right, which includes decision-making, management, and control over tourism development (UNDP and KLH, 2000). Community participation is not just the provision of resources from and by the community or their involvement as labor in tourism (Damanik, 2005). Eco-tourism development activities by the community in Kungkuk Village can be imitated by other village communities so that they do not damage the natural state of nature but can still improve the economy of the village community.

5. Media. It refers to the most efficient power to disseminate information to the entire community (Wu et al., 2016). Through journalists, the media plays an important role in disseminating the uniqueness of tourist destinations, especially in Batu City. Through journalists, the media plays an important role in disseminating the beauty of tourist destinations, especially in Batu City. Because Batu City has been designated as a Tourist City in Indonesia. With digital media, information becomes a necessity. The role of the media is very important in encouraging the tourism sector. Journalists and the media will inform readers and listeners about interesting and unique tourist destinations to attract tourists to promote tourist destinations (Hardianto, 2019). The use of media actors in tourism promotion is very efficient and effective in Indonesia (Kurniawato, 2016). In addition to this, Strand (2010) states that news media contain newspapers and print, broadcast, and television media as providers of news and information. Besides, anything that is combined above the characteristics of the news media and presented with the digital method can be said to be electronic media (Hall, 2012). Therefore, eco-tourism marketing through online media changes it in a positive direction by presenting its information effectively.

6. Academics. Eco-tourism theory arguably would not exist and definitely would not exist in its current form were it not for the involvement of academics. Academics have played a critical stewardship role in conceptualizing and operationalizing eco-tourism (Arraize et al., 2018). Academics or universities, as educational practitioners, contribute
to creating high-qualified tourism human resources that are reliable, professional, intelligent, efficient, and have global insight. Furthermore, academics and universities uphold the local wisdom values by providing satisfactory education or input on tourism development, both relevantly and effectively (Hardianto, 2019). Therefore, an academic role is also necessary for the development of eco-tourism in Batu City. In the Malang Raya area (Batu City, Malang City, and Malang Regency), several universities such as Brawijaya University, Malang State University, and other universities. Every university has the capacity of human resources to develop environmental-based tourism (eco-tourism) because academics need to develop this knowledge in the real world. In addition, academics have a program in community service. The program is contained in the *Tri dharma* (three basic obligations) of higher education (Law No. 12 of 2012).

From these actors’ involvement, several weaknesses and strengths have been processed in the development of eco-tourism in Batu City, especially in Kungkung tourist village. So that there is a need for improvement and renewal in the involvement of each actor, these improvements are expected to be more effective and efficient in eco-tourism development. Furthermore, Stoddard & Pollard (2012) believe that the triple-bottom line philosophical orientation lies in organizations’ ability to develop and implement traditional strategies that are economically sustainable and explicitly incorporate environmental and social sustainability strategies. In this term, the tourism sector provides a unique opportunity to test triple bottom-line efficiency as it includes several stakeholders with different values and interests. Besides, Carter and Rogers (2008), supported by Sapukotanage et al. (2018), argue the triple-bottom-line approach is a popular framework used to evaluate the sustainability of a supply chain as it is not only concerned with financial aspects. It emphasizes environmental and social measures that allow organizations to understand that sustainability consists of three components at a broader level. It consists of the natural environment, society, and economic performance. In other words, the triple-bottom-line considers the balance of environmental, social, and economic elements in carrying out development in all sectors of activity. Therefore, the researcher combines these two theories to analyze and develop eco-tourism development strategies through stakeholder collaboration.
The figure above shows how the Penta-helix model works and how it solves various problems surrounding eco-tourism. It wants to inform each stakeholder about their role in achieving eco-tourism development. The description of the black and blue arrows is the effect of one module on another. Simultaneously, the dotted arrow means that eco-tourism indirectly affects agendas. In addition, this collaborative model demonstrates environmental conservation, collaboration, socio-cultural uniqueness, economy and social responsibility, destination competitiveness, and equity, which demand the stakeholders’ unity as they must have the same vision regardless of their respective interests. Besides, that framework also suggests periodic monitoring and evaluation in unifying the final result. Its application must ensure the development of economically sustainable, environmentally friendly, and socially responsible eco-tourism. It suggests that this concept has a mechanism where stakeholders involved, like government, private eco-tourism enterprises, community, academics, and the media, have a role in strengthening eco-tourism development.

Furthermore, the government suggested in this term refers to the Tourism Office and the District Office. Meanwhile, the term private consists of homestays, cafes, travel, investors, and the like focusing on eco-tourism enterprises. Besides, the community consists of Pokdarwis, people who agree with developing a tourist village, and youth organizations. On the other hand, media consists of television, radio, print media, and other electronic media. Meanwhile, Academic Education consists of students, researchers, lecturers,
students, and the like who play a role in theory renewal. Therefore, researchers propose a clue for the coordination process. It contains regulations, cultural uniqueness, destination competitiveness, justice, collaboration, cost-benefit distribution, and social responsibility. In other words, it is necessary to build the coordination process between stakeholders in achieving effective collaboration (Zeho et al., 2020). The coordination can be related to the regulations. The regulation becomes basic for the success of developing eco-tourism (Archana, 2013). The coordination process aims to determine the agenda of the three-building objectives such as social, economy, and environment. These three objectives are drawn in the triple bottom line. All stakeholders interested in eco-tourism development must work accountably and transparently in the management of tourism resources (Damanik, 2005).

In Figure 4, the environmental agenda is placed at the top of the triangle. It means that the environmental agenda is reinforced with the social and economic agenda below it. The environment plan consists of programs such as Management of Natural Resource, the Control of Negative Impact in the buildings, the Control of Pollution, the Compliance of the Regulation, and the Environmental Conservation. Because tourists' satisfaction is influenced by the need to be close to nature and respect nature, conservation of natural resources needs to be done correctly (Digun-Aweto et al., 2020). The economy plan consists of some rights and Obligations that are the same for all participants of the development of tourism, the development of infrastructure, marketing, integrating a network of the tourism industry, and tourism information.

Meanwhile, the plan of social consists of strengthening the identity of the culture, promoting positive perspectives from the communities, and the active involvement of the local society. These agendas decide the success of eco-tourism development. Thus, these agendas can evaluate and monitor the function inside the step as the determiner of the success of three agendas (environment, economy, and social). Besides, the researcher used the black linking line after the step of evaluation and monitoring. The linking line is used to give the input toward some stakeholders involved in the development of eco-tourism. The perfect model cannot separate every point, but it can explore and connect each other deeply. It is remembered that a framework like this is never made before. The concept series in this journal will explore each indicator. The newest concept in ecology development is needed in Batu City, Indonesia. Because of the interesting tourism place, many local and international tourists visit this tourism place. According to the modern trend, the natural environment area such as social forest is one of the interesting tourism places, and the other such as ecological tourism, eco-tourism, and qualified tourism (Œwieca et al., 2014).
CONCLUSION

This study has evaluated and explored eco-tourism development in Batu city and identified the stakeholders involved in this development. The findings obtained by the researcher are that the Batu City eco-tourism is currently still not going well. The government has not maximized the natural potential contained in Batu City in the development of eco-tourism; so far, this development has only ‘replaced’ natural tourism potential that has not been ‘managed’ into artificial tourism potential. The absence of an Ecotourism Road Map in Batu City has also, in many private parties and the public can freely convert the function of green land into residences, villas, agriculture, and others. In addition, the government has not tried to maximize the role of existing actors, not only the community and the private sector. However, it has not maximized the role of academics and media in developing and disseminating eco-tourism objects such as Kungkuk Village.

The research shows that adopting the triple bottom line principle can help increase the relationship between the stakeholders of eco-tourism regarding increasing the financial work, spreading the market opportunity, formulating and deciding the inclusive decision, and increasing the competitiveness of the destination. Besides, the research does not only propose the framework of new collaboration and holistic that integrate the theory of Pentahelix and the principle of the triple bottom line to develop eco-tourism in the scientist only. Therefore, the framework can become the brief policy for the stakeholders of eco-tourism to consider the elements of environment, social and economy as the common agenda in determining the stakeholders’ decision. This research has limitations in technical coordination between stakeholders; it is necessary to develop and improve it so that this research can develop in the future.

REFERENCES

Alinska, A., Filipiak, Beata Z., & Kosztowniak, A. (2018). The Importance of the Public Sector in Sustainable Development in Poland. Sustainability, 10, 3278; doi:10.3390/su10093278


Korten, David C., 2006. The Great Turning, Berret Koehler Publisher Inc. San Fransisco and Kumarian Press


World Tourism Organization (2018), Tourism and Culture Synergies,UNWTO, Madrid, DOI: https://doi.org/10.18111/9789284418978


